Principles of Writing

Rhetoric 102

Holguin

Spring 2018

**Peer Review Instructions: Formal Essay One**

The first formal essay requires you to act as a critic to your fellow students’ papers and spend time reviewing and analyzing their arguments, use of the primary and secondary sources, and general problems that might arise from word choices, syntax, and structure. You need to finish all your critiques by next week to return to your fellow students before you turn in your final drafts to me. Use your time in and out of the class wisely.

You are asked to use the electronic versions of these peer reviews. You can then choose to either email the documents to your group OR provide them with hard-copies. You must send me electronic copies of all peer reviews to Blackboard before the final draft is due. This peer review process goes into your first draft grade.

**Editor’s Name: Horris Feng**

**Student’s Name: Alex Gao**

1. What is the student’s thesis? Highlight it in his or her paper. What fairy tale is used in this argument? Is anything missing from the introduction in terms of context or background? Fix any errors you find in the paper and highlight those issues for the student.

Alex’s thesis is “the Disney version of Cinderella represents American ideology and the version adapted by Lin Lan shows more Chinese ideology.”

Alex uses Lin Lan’s version of Cinderella.

The summary of two versions of Cinderella is somewhat too short. More details could be offered.

1. How does the student’s close-reading of the film and fairy tale versions of *Cinderella* further support or naysay Zipes’ reading of ideological issues with Disney? Does the student effectively close-read the film and the fairy tale or does they need further analysis and/or support? What would you suggest adding? Show the students places in the paper that he or she needs more evidence from the film or text in the paper itself.

Alex’s close-reading of primary sources is good in paragraph #3, #4 and #5 while that in paragraph #6 and #7 needs to be improved.

Alex needs further analysis in paragraph #6 and #7 to support his arguments.

In paragraph #6, Alex should offer more details in Lin Lan’s Cinderella to support his argument that the Chinese version weakens the teamwork aspect of Cinderella or to show that Lin Lan stresses the individual aspect, which has the same meaning as his argument. In paragraph #7, Alex needs to add details from Lin Lan’s Cinderella to support his disagreement with Zipes rather than simply saying “In the Chinese version, there is also no evidence of male-manipulation.”, which may hurt his credibility.

1. How does the student summarize Zipes’ argument? Is this an accurate summary of the article? Does a brief summary occur in the introductory paragraphs? If not, this is a structural issue you should point out. Does the student connect the new example of *Cinderella* to the Zipes’ use of *Snow White*? Does that connection work for the coherence of the argument as a whole?

Alex summarizes Zipes’ argument as “how Disney and his animations affect the perspectives we have about the fairy tales”, though I do not think it is a summary of Zipes’ argument or an accurate summary of the article.

It seems that there is not a brief summary of Zipes’ thesis statement in the introductory paragraphs.

Yes, Alex does connect the new example of *Cinderella* to the Zipes’ use of *Snow White* in one of his paragraph, but not in the introductory paragraphs.

Yes, it does. Alex uses rich analysis to show that the same case happens in Disney’s Cinderella, which is a consistent usage of quotation in my opinion.

1. Does the paper consistently signpost its thesis and transition from one point to the next with helpful cues? Highlight any clunky moments where you think the paper lacks a cohesive thread and indicate paragraphs and page numbers here. For example, if the student only uses “first”/ “second”/ “in conclusion” to show changes from one paragraph to the next, you should explain ideas for smoother transitions. Keep in mind, Zipes could act as a helpful transitional thread.

The paper consistently signposts its thesis but not its transition.

The beginning of paragraph #5, page 3. (add “apart from ~~”)

The last line in page 3. (add “by contrast, ~~”)

The beginning of paragraph #7, page 5. (add “despite ~~”)

1. Pick two sentences that seem awkward or just don’t make sense to you the way they are currently written. Rewrite them without the problems you see persisting.
2. Sentence One

He believes that the literary content limited the people who can understand, ~

* + Revised Sentence

He believes that the literary content limited the range of readers within the people who can understand, ~

1. Sentence One

When writers are creating new stories, they will add their ideas and values connected with their cultures and ideologies into their works.

* + Revised Sentence

When writers create new stories, they will add their ideas and values connected with their cultures and ideologies into their works.

1. Does the paper fulfill all of the requirements for the final draft? What still needs to be added? Make a checklist for the student of things he or she still needs to write.

Create works cited page and improve in-text citation

Extend his essay to at least six full pages

Add concrete details from Lin Lan’s Cinderella to support his argument in paragraph #6 and #7

Use more creative sentence structures to quote Zipes’ article

Polish the summaries of two versions of Cinderella and Zipes’ thesis statement

Apart from plot and characters, try to make use of other evidence in Cinderella, for example, dialogue

It seems that there is no paraphrase of Zipes’ argument in your essay. Thus, try to make use of Zipes’ argument creatively

Enrich the so-what factor

1. What are the key moments/scenes from *Cinderella* that were used as visual support? What are the key textual support moments from the fairy tale? How does this paper’s interpretation of Disney’s ideologies differ from Zipes’?

Disney’s version: Cinderella’s stepsisters teared her dress apart, Lucifer fell off from the chimney, the premise for entering the ball, help from animals, and Cinderella’s own struggle and positive attitude toward life

Lin Lan’s version: The kill of the yellow cow and Beauty, punishment on Pock Face, Beauty chose the scholar as her husband, and Beauty’s interaction with the neighbor old woman

Apart from the ideology about male-manipulation, Alex’s interpretation of Disney’s ideologies is similar to Zipes’.

1. Check for any MLA format errors or missing information. Highlight these issues on the student’s paper.

Lack of intext citation of pages and names of sources

1. What is the paper’s “so what?” factor? Does the conclusion include this larger issue? What does the conclusion need?

The paper’s “so what?” factor is “By analyzing different versions of the tales and the ideologies contained in them, we can have a deeper insight of the different cultures.”

Yes, it does.

The conclusion needs to interact with Zipes’ arguments.

1. What grade does this essay deserve if this was a final draft? What was your favorite part?

A-/B+

My favorite part is Alex’s analysis and interaction with Zipes’ article about punishment and violence as well as aristocratic elite and social status. (Refer to paragraph #3 to #5)